Policy Reform Post-Tyler

Preserving Homeownership, Preventing Vacancy, and Reducing Legal Risk

December 5, 2023



Policy Reform Post-*Tyler v. Hennepin County*

Preserving Homeownership, Preventing Vacancy, and Reducing Legal Risk

- *Tyler* Overview and Need for Reform (Community Progress and NCLC)
- Populations Most Impacted by Tax Foreclosures (NCLC)
- Preventing Tax Foreclosures (NCLC)
- Addressing Vacant, Abandoned, and Deteriorated Properties (Community Progress and NCLC)



Overview & Need for Reform

Case summary and identification of key unanswered questions



Equity should drive reform

1)Keep people in their homes!

2)Address the VAD next door!

PLEASE READ A RESPOND TO

DOCUMENT

Key Terms

For purposes of this discussion:

Property tax foreclosure ("foreclosure")

Foreclosure sale (aka, "public sale")

Strict foreclosure

Redemption rights

Equity

Surplus

5

Property Tax Foreclosure in General

Hundreds of systems, most allow for the sale of one, the other, or both:



OR



This Photo by Unknown Author is licensed under CC BY

Summary of Tyler v. Hennepin County

- Ms. Tyler moved out, didn't pay taxes for 5 years
- Hennepin County took title, ~\$15k in debt was wiped out
- 15 months later, County sold property for ~\$40k
- No mechanism for former owner to claim excess proceeds or value



Foreclosing local governments can continue to utilize tax foreclosure, but cannot retain value that exceeds the total amount of the tax lien being foreclosed.

Liability both retroactive and prospective



But....



10

When does the "taking" occur?

How can local governments determine whether a surplus exists?



11

- Does the foreclosure process ever have a high-bid auction of the property itself?
 - Is the sale followed by a long redemption period before final transfer?
 - Is there a high-bid sale only if prior auctions don't yield a minimum bid?
 - Is the sale conducted in a manner that could potentially generate competitive bidding?
 - What if tax liens or deeds are sold in a bulk sale to highest bidder?

- Does the right to surplus proceeds come with limitations?
 - Illinois permits recovery through indemnity fund but awards are capped unless owners can prove they were not negligent in failing to pay taxes
 - Alabama requires owners to first redeem before they can recover surplus proceeds

- Does access to surplus require owner to take certain actions before final transfer of property, such as requesting a sale?
 - Can states rely upon Nelson v. City of New York?
- Does owner get adequate notice of right to request sale and surplus?
- Does owner need to bring a court action to request sale?

- Does *Tyler* apply if tax certificate or lien is sold to private buyer, who later has right to foreclose right of redemption and become owner?
 - Private buyer is acting under color of state law and performing a public function
 - Colorado and Massachusetts Attorney General opinions

Populations Most Impacted

Older adults and communities of color



Baltimore Tax Sale Prevention Clinics (2020)

- 72% of clients were older adults
- 48% were disabled
- 85% identify as Black
- Nearly three-quarters (72%) reported annual household incomes of less than \$30,000

Property Tax Foreclosure Risk Factors for Older Adults

- Past surveys have identified the main hurdles for older adults facing unaffordable taxes or tax liens
 - High taxes, death of a spouse, increase in expenses
 - Insufficient exemptions, inadequate repayment plans, or other relief options for low-income older adults
 - Addition of interest and penalties to account for late payment
 - Dementia/ cognitive impairment/ difficulty remembering to apply for property tax relief programs
 - Lack of technology or difficulty applying for property tax relief programs

Impact on Communities of Color

- Homeowners of color more likely to face property tax foreclosure
- Purchase of tax liens by investors leads to gentrification of communities, which can push out lower-income residents and the elderly from once affordable neighborhoods
- In other neighborhoods property values are further depressed and there is an increase in blight, including vacant and abandoned properties



Dots on the map show foreclosures that followed tax liens since 2005, and the shading represents number of pending foreclosure cases.

Minorities are hit the hardest

72% of pending foreclosures are in neighborhoods where less than

20% of the population is white.



The Racial Homeownership Gap

FIGURE 1

Homeownership by Race or Ethnicity



Sources: Decennial Census and the American Community Survey.

Legacy of Housing Discrimination

- Laws and policies that segregated public & private housing
 - Redlining
 - Financing
 - Exclusionary zoning
- Homeownership Rate–72.7% white and 44% Black individuals

The New York Times

: TheUpshot

SELF-FULFILLING PROPHECIES

How Redlining's Racist Effects Lasted for Decades



Racial Wealth Gap

Other wealth building tools:

- Retirement Accounts
 - 60% White, 34% Black, 30% Hispanic
- Family-owned businesses
 - Black and Hispanic families are half as likely to own a business
- Vehicle ownership
 - 90% White, 80% Hispanic, 73% Black

Property taxes add significantly to the cost of owning a home

- Black and Hispanic households pay disproportionately higher taxes relative to their homes' value
- Leads to higher carrying costs for Black households
 - On average Black households pay \$390 more per year in taxes compared to white households
 - Nearly a quarter of the disparity in total homeownership costs for Black households as compared to white households is due to local property tax assessments
- For families living on the financial edge, higher property taxes combined with other property-related fees and costs increase the risk of foreclosure and displacement

High rates of property tax foreclosure drains wealth and destabilizes communities of color

- Government has an obligation to affirmatively further fair housing
- This includes taking measures to preserve existing homes, a source of affordable housing
- Reform to tax process to increase protections
 - Decrease the role of investors in the process
- Pay particular attention to inequities in the tax assessment and appeals process
- Make notices and information readily accessible, especially in the languages most commonly spoken in the community

Preventing Tax **Foreclosures**

Assessments, Notice, Exemptions, Payment Plans, Redemption Periods, and Heirs' Protections



Key Policy Goals

 Prevention, prevention, prevention: the door is open



What States Can Do to Reduce Property Tax Foreclosures

- New <u>NCLC 2-page issue brief</u>
- Assessment Process and Relief Programs
- How to Make the Tax Foreclosure Process More Fair

Property Tax Assessments

PROBLEM

- Inequities in tax assessment & irregular property tax assessments
 - Black and Hispanic homeowners:
 - pay disproportionately high taxes relative to their homes' values
 - 10-13% higher property tax = roughly an additional \$6.5 billion owed for property taxes each year.

Property Tax Assessments



*Demonstrative only

Property Tax Assessments SOLUTION

- Implementing or improving oversight for assessments
- Require regular, accurate assessments
- Industry-standard techniques
- But caution re: payment shock



Property Tax Assessment Appeals

Black homeowners are less likely to appeal their assessed values and win if they do appeal.

If they do win, they receive smaller reductions in their assessed values

Open, accessible appeals process
including comprehensive notice

Notice

Require **comprehensive notice**, in English and the most common languages spoken in the state, of:

- all property tax relief programs,
- options to prevent the sale,
- the time and place of the sale,
- the right to redeem the property after a
- sale, and
- details about other post-sale procedures.

Exemptions

• More generous exemptions to older, disabled, and low-income households

• Cap the amount of taxes owed based on a percentage of a homeowner's income ("circuit breakers")

Exemptions

Progressive exemption tool

Flat dollar homestead exemption or credit

Boston: Reduce the taxable value of principal residence by a flat dollar amount, 35% of the average assessed home value in the city that year.

In 2021, the first \$295,503 of a primary residence value was exempt from property taxes.

More benefit to lower value homes

Easy to administer

Payment Plans

PROBLEM

Homeowners living paycheck to paycheck who do not pay their taxes as part of their monthly mortgage payment struggle to pay tax bills that are due twice a year in large lump sums.

Payment Plans

SOLUTION

Allow local governments to accept monthly payments to pre-pay taxes or work out other payment plans for homeowners who cannot make a lump-sum payment of the full outstanding balance.
Redemption Period

A period after the home is sold at foreclosure when homeowner can still reclaim the home.

PROBLEM

Some states:

- do not have one,
- allow only a short window,
- or pile on large penalties and fees.

Redemption Period

SOLUTION

- Reasonable redemption period
- Limit the interest, penalties, fees, and costs to a fair amount,
- Allow redemption through a payment plan, and
- Require effective notice of these rights.



Protecting Heirs Property Owners

Heirs Property Owners and Property Tax Relief

- Heirs Property
 - Family owned home that is jointly owned by descendants of a deceased person whose estate has not yet gone through probate
- They own the home but if names are not on the deed; no "record title"
 - Must go through probate but not familiar with the process
 - Time consuming and expensive

Consequences for Heirs: High Tax Burden

- The deceased owner's exemption most likely terminates upon death
- By the time heirs realize the amounts due for property taxes, it is often soon before or after a tax sale and options are limited.

Relief for Heirs

SOLUTION

- Ensure that heirs who reside in the home are eligible for the same relief as any homeowner-occupant.
 - Heirs = owner
 - Allow use of affidavit of heirship
 - Eliminate penalties for failure to notify assessor right away
 - Provide retroactive relief (for all)



- NCLC, Property Tax Foreclosures on Heirs' Property (Aug. 2023)
- NCLC, Supreme Court Stops Equity Theft in Property Tax Foreclosures (June 2023)
- Property Tax Foreclosures on Heirs Property: An Interview with Sarah Mancini, Andrea Bopp Stark, and Kristopher Smith (NCLC & LISC Sept. 2023)
- Video on Property Tax Foreclosures & Older Adults: Tyler v. Hennepin

The Consumer Law Practice Series



Home Foreclosures

2023 Second Edition

With a Chapter on Preventing Property Tax Foreclosure

www.nclc.org/library

Legal Aid & nonprofits receive 50% by emailing publications@nclc.org.



Contact NCLC

Primary point of contact for case consultation and policy support for NCLC on these issues:

Nketiah ("Ink") Berko

Equal Justice Works Fellow, Sponsored by the Rosotti Foundation

nberko@nclc.org

 Focusing on heirs property, property tax foreclosure, and Medicaid estate recovery

Addressing Vacant, Abandoned, and Deteriorated (VAD) Properties



Vacant, Abandoned, and Deteriorated (VAD) Properties

Negative Impacts:

- Public health
- Individual wealth
- Public finances



VAD Properties and Tax Foreclosure: The Problem

- Properties stuck in limbo
- Foreclosure procedures do not produce insurable title
- No path to return properties to productive reuse





Shorten the process for VAD properties



Shorten the process for VAD properties



Sell the dirt, not the debt



Shorten the process for VAD properties



Sell the dirt, not the debt



Provide judicial oversight and constitutional notice



Shorten the process for VAD properties



Sell the dirt, not the debt



Provide judicial oversight and constitutional notice



Allow for the transfer properties that do not sell to local governments or land banks

Additional Resources

POLICY BRIEF

Tyler v. Hennepin County

Analysis and Policy Reform Options for State and Local Governments

On May 25, 2023, the United States Supreme Court released its opinion in **Tyler v. Hennepin County**, making a rare but significant incursion into the realm of property tax law and, more specifically, the state and local government practice of property tax foreclosure.

About a dozen statios will be most directly impacted by this decision and will need to closely review their proporty tas statutes and practices. However, the 7-jetr decision has also renewed attention to longistanding mogulities in the property tas system, from assessment to collection to enforcement and bereclosure. B presents all states and local governments with an unprecedented opportunity to create more equitable, efficient, and effective property tax systems.

While the focus of the Center for Community Progress has long been enhancing and coordinating a range of legal and policy tools—like property tax foreclosure—to help communities address vacant, abandened, and deteriorated (VAD) properties, the Tyler decision has far more wide-ranging implications.

This is a key moment to engage leverakers to advance reforms that maximize equity and tames for individual while still protecting a community ability to address viscancy and disinvestment, conditions that deproportionately impact Black and Brown neighborhoods.

This brief provides state and local government leaders with our perspective and analysis of the Tyter case by identifying and answering, to the best of our ability, key questions left unanswered by the Court. We also suggest high-level policy reforms state and

Property tax foreclosure, or foreclosure: The range of judicial, non-judicial, and other processes across the country used to axinguish an owner's and other interested particles rights to real property and where the property is utimately transformed to a prove course to earthic the batal arrower of unraild and where the property is utilimately transformed to a new owner to satisfy the total amount of unpaid taxes and other public debts. The transfer may be accomplished by a "foreclosure sale," or a "strict foreclosure." Foreclosure sale: A public auction held at the conclusion of the foreclosure where the property is offered to rate, the minimum bid reflects the total public debt overd, and the winning bidder is willing to pay the highest amount above the minimum bid.

Key Terms*

Strict foreclosure: Where the foreclosing entity in a tax foreclosure, either the local government or a tax lien holder, takes direct title to the property in full satisfaction of the public debt. There is no public auction or sale.

"The terms defined above are solely for convenience and use in this r



d Policy Reform Options areas.org 1 August 2023



Delinquent Property Tax Enforcement

Equity, and Improve Public Services



Reclaiming Vacant Properties Conference 2024

October 9-11, 2024 Hyatt Regency St. Louis, Missouri



Contact Information

Community Progress

Matt Kreis

General Counsel

mkreis@communityprogress.org.

Libby Benton

Senior Counsel

ebenton@communityprogress.org



Flint (Headquarters) 111 E. Court St Suite 2C-1 Flint, MI 48502

Washington, DC 1101 14th St NW Suite 510 Washington, DC 20005

Atlanta 299 Joseph E. Lowery Blvd NW Suite 203 Atlanta, GA 30314

Chicago 100 S. State St Suite 405 Chicago, IL 60603

communityprogress.org



© 2023 Center for Community Progress. The Center for Community Progress owns all copyright for this presentation. You may reproduce copies of this presentation for non-commercial use to share with colleagues at your organization. The presentation may not be copied or reproduced for other purposes without the express written permission of the Center for Community Progress.